Voting of Demands for Grants—(contd.)

Demand No. XIII—General Administration—Rs. 60,372.

President.—The next item is the voting of the Demand for "General Administration".

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Sir, I rise to move for a grant of Rs. 60,372 under "XIII—General Administration". The details of the demand are—

(1)	Huzur—Establishment, Travelling Allowance, Supplies and Services, and Contingencies	Rs. 48,447
(2)	Legislative Council	,, 11,925
	Total ..	Rs. 60,372

I don't think that the details call for any explanation, as the provisions in most cases are the same as those for the current year, and in some cases even less.

Some provision on account of the Special Finance Committee has been found necessary for 1103 also, as the Committee is expected to wind up its business by the end of Thulam 1103 only. A provision of Rs. 1,000 is accordingly made for the expenses of the Committee.

Under "Legislative Council" the demand for the coming year is less than that for the current year. The decrease is mainly due to the reduced provision made under "Travelling Allowance", as the various Select Committees of the Council are expected to wind up their business in the early part of the year.

Under "Temporary Establishment" provision is made for four months for a clerk on Rs. 60 for the Select Committee for the Tenancy Regulation. This provision is made here, as it is a Committee of the Legislative Council.

I now request that the House will be pleased to vote for the demand.

The following motions, not pressed by the mover thereof, were considered to have been withdrawn:—

Motions Nos. 1 and 2.

Huzur Secretariat.

HUZUR ESTABLISHMENT.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 33,742 for "staff.", by one rupee.*

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 35,429 for "servants, staff, etc., (including leave allowance) by one rupee.*

President.—Mr. Ikkanda Wariar, you may move your motion.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Motions Nos. 3 to 6.

HUZUR SECRETARIAT—TOTAL.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 48,447 for "Huzur Secretariat" by one rupee.*

Mr. Poulo Manpilli.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 74,277 under "Demand No. XIII" by Rs. 100.*

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 74,277 for "Huzur Secretariat" by Rs. 100.*

Dr. A R. Menon.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 74,277 under "Demand No. XIII" by one rupee.*

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—Sir, I move to reduce the allotment of Rs 48,047—Huzur Secretariat—by one rupee.

Sir, my object in tabling this motion is to draw the attention of the Government to the grievances of the third class passengers in the Shoranur-Cochin Railway. I am sure that it will be conceded that the compartments in our railway, are, without the least exaggeration, only pigeon holes when compared with those obtaining in the other civilized countries. I am sure they will fetch the first prize in an exhibition showing the evolution in the design and construction of railway carriages of being, the oldest and most archaic type, and our Cochin railways will get the gold medal for preserving and maintaining it in those archaic forms and ways.

Sir, only those who have the good fortune or bad fortune to travel in the third class can feel the inconveniences and hardships they are put to every day, nay, every minute. Only the wearer knows where the shoe pinches. Our third class compartments are neither airy nor roomy. They are not always maintained under proper repair. They are, as a rule, dirty and insanitary. They are not water-proof, especially when old and rotten carriages are used. Newly constructed or painted carriages are run before the paints are dry. The seats are invariably wet during the rains and full of dust during summer. Some of the carriages are leaky, and in the case of others the shutters cannot be closed, and if closed, cannot be opened, they not having sufficiently strong and proper adjustable hinges.

Again, Sir, the inconvenience caused by the absence of lavatory arrangements and water supply in trains is notorious. Fortunately, latrines are provided to all the stations in recent years. But they are absolutely of no use to the passengers in the train who, on account of the short stay of the train in almost all our stations, will not dare to risk a break of the journey. I do admit they have sufficient time at Ernakulam, Chalakkudi and Trichur, but the accommodation in these latrines is so insufficient and the sanitation so bad that no respect-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

able man would think of sparing the kidney by spoiling the nose.

Again, Sir, the lighting arrangements both in the platforms and the trains are anything but satisfactory. Each compartment gets only half of a light, and even these are not always lighted. Even if lighted, they serve no useful purpose. They do not even serve to enable the passenger to pick out the *samans* when he gets down, and much less for reading or writing anything. To my thinking, they serve only to announce the advent of night and for harassing the already uncomfortable passenger by raindrops during the winter. The lights supplied in platforms are very small and not sufficiently powerful. The major portions of the glasses are painted for inscribing the names of stations. All the lights will not be generally lighted on all days, and even when lighted, it will be done only when the train arrives, and will be put out even before the tickets are collected from the passengers.

Another and a longstanding perpetual complaint is overcrowding. It is not infrequently that we see that a compartment intended for eight, carrying double that number and sometimes more. It arises in two ways. One, for want of provision by railway authorities for sufficient accommodation, especially on important occasions such as the Trichur *Pooram*, the Crangnaur *Bharani*, etc., and the other, for want of time for the passengers to search for the less crowded compartments. The former can be remedied by running specials during those occasions, and the latter by making some structural alterations in the orthodox style of building carriages. This can be done by having in future what are called corridor trains and also by having long rows of seats lengthwise rather than breadthwise to the carriages as is at present done. When the train stops, the passengers rush into the compartments which stop just in front of the railway station buildings, and they are crowded. They have neither the time nor the patience to search for vacant rooms. So many of the people rush in one and the same compartment. By the introduction of corridor trains, this difficulty can be avoided, as they can, after getting into one compartment, search for vacant seats. I, therefore, suggest that immediate provision may be made for:—

(1) Corridor trains with lavatories and water supply at either end.

(2) Electric lights.

(3) Exercise of better supervision over the sanitary and lighting arrangements.

President.—There is a Railway Advisory Committee held every quarter, and these defects and the inconvenience

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

caused to the public are considered by the Committee. I shall take particular care to send up all these points for the consideration of the Committee and see what they will do in the matter.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—In the light of this assurance I withdraw my motion.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Will you permit me, Sir, to add one more point to the list? Now, there are only few signalling stations in the Railway. When the train leaves Ernakulam, the next signalling station is Alwaye and then Karukutti and so on. Meanwhile, in the intermediate stations, the train arrives sometimes a little early and leaves a little before the time, and the passengers are put to trouble. I may tell you that, on one occasion, I had to experience this difficulty. The train left Chowwara 5 minutes earlier than the usual time.

President.—Did you bring that to the notice of the authorities ?

Mr. M. K. Raman.—No. I only pointed out the irregularity to the Station Master, and he said he could not do anything. It seems that the Guard wanted to take the train earlier.

President.—That is violating the rule. But such instances will be very few.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—If all the stations are made signalling stations, then this difficulty will not arise.

President.—That is not possible.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—In the list of complaints raised by the Hon'ble Member for Urakam, I may also add the inconvenience felt by the passengers at the stations in the waiting rooms. During the winter season rain causes much inconvenience in the waiting rooms which are faced to the west, and in the summer season, after one o'clock, there is no chance of recoursing to the waiting rooms.

President.—You may include that also in the list. There need be only one communication.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—Not that I have no other grievances.

President.—But let the more urgent ones be attended to.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—The level crossings are narrow, begin and end very abruptly, especially at the Vadakkancheri and Edappalli stations.

Then, an Indian Refreshment Room at the Ernakulam Railway Station is very necessary. We do not get a cup of coffee, if we leave Shoranur, except from those we generally see in the platform. We do not want one on such a large scale as that at Shoranur, as there may not be very many caste-Hindus resorting to that.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

President.—These matters may be brought to the notice of the Committee.

Then, Motion No. 4, Mr. Poulo Mampilli, absent. Then No. 5, Mr. Mathew.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—I do not move it.

Mr. Poulo Mampilli being absent, his cut was taken as withdrawn. Mr. Mathew's motion was not pressed, and hence considered withdrawn.

Mr. K. S. Rama Ayyar.—On a point of information. May I know what is the total amount advanced to Government officials as loans for the purchase of cars, buildings and such other purposes?

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—As per information supplied to us during the Meenam session, it comes to nearly 1¾ lakhs.

President.—That information will be supplied shortly.

Mr. K. S. Rama Ayyar.—One more point. What is the security demanded from them?

President.—If it is for the purchase of a car, the car will be secured to the Government; if it is for a building, the *paramba* and the building will be in the name of the Government till the amount is repaid.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—A registered mortgage deed will have to be executed, in the name of the Government, and it will be released only after the amount is paid.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—What is the rate of interest?

President.—6¼%.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Suppose, for the construction of a building, you give a loan of two thousand rupees, and the man who takes the loan is not going to construct a building.

President.—Then the only thing is, he has his employment, and he will take more interest in his employment than in these 2,000 rupees.

Mr. K. Achyuta Menon.—That is not so, Sir. We do not lend the amount, if the compound on which the building is to be built is not sufficient security. We do not expect the house to be built.

President.—But was there ever an instance when a Government loan was not realised?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—No.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Will the same concession be extended to people other than officials?

President.—Only o officials.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, I wish to move the motion standing in my name, to express the disapproval of the policy of the Government in lending public funds to officials for private pur-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

poses and of the differential treatment in such lending that is in vogue now. There are two points. One is to express the disapproval of this House against the policy of lending money—public money—to be utilised for private purposes, and also the differential treatment that has been shown between those that are high in power, and those that are low in the official ladder.

Sir, from the questions and answers of to-day, one would think that I am a man whose sole occupation is to find fault with the officials. Certainly, it shows that I am not vested with officialism. And there is one thing that gives me consolation, and it is this, that I may not be open to the charge that I have become a follower of that officialdom in this State. When that day comes, I shall ask my own heart why such a terrible punishment has been inflicted upon me.

Before forming an opinion, it would be worth while for the House to go through a small list of officers who have borrowed money from the Government. Will you kindly listen to this?

Mr. Verghese, Chief Justice, pay Rs. 750, money borrowed—Rs 4,000.

Dr. Rao, Civil Surgeon, for house construction—Rs. 4,800, and for carriage—Rs. 800.

Mr. T. M. Krishna Menon, one of the Judges of the Chief Court, then District Judge, money borrowed—Rs. 3,000 for a motor car.

Mr. M. D. Narayana Ayyar, Assistant Engineer, pay Rs. 320, money borrowed—Rs. 1,920 for purchase of two cars.

Mr. C. Mathai, Director of Public Instruction, pay Rs. 750, money borrowed—Rs. 3,000.

Mr. V. B. Vaidyanatha Ayyar, Excise Superintendent, pay Rs. 600, money borrowed—Rs. 2,400 for a car.

Then, Sir, *those rejected.*

Yussuf Khan, drawing a magnificent salary of Rs. 15, asked for a sum of Rs. 120 and rejected.

Subrahmanya Ayyar, pay Rs. 20, requested for a loan of Rs. 200 and was rejected, and there are many others.

Now, Sir, this is the list. This list speaks for itself, without any comment on it. The other day, in a statement made by the Chief Medical Officer to my friend, the Member for Trichur, he said that the public have more belief in the Government officials than in Members of this Council. This is your argument, and it is a very novel way of arguing, indeed.

Here are people drawing Rs. 750 and Rs. 1,000, and say those who draw more than Rs. 300 come to the Government and say, "we want a motor car; will you, out of the public exchequer, out of the money, collected from the shrunken, shrivelled peasants, money taken in the shape of 2 annas, 4 annas and 8 annas, will

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

you give us at a cheap rate of interest that no bank will allow, sufficient money for the purchase of a car?" Public money is thus given to be returned in 40 or 100 instalments. I ask the Government whether they are prepared to give us some money on these terms. Are we not entitled to public funds as much as these officials? In their official enactments, I do not think, anywhere there is a clause that the Government will help them in their financial difficulties. I say that is no part of the responsibility of the Government to lend to its servants. Are the people to look into the financial difficulties of officials? They do work, and they are paid for it. It does not reflect much credit on the part of the Government, especially on the part of the Heads of Departments to borrow money, as I said, the source of which is the poor and the miserable people—poverty-stricken people, from whom this money is collected. What is more? In the list you will see a number of cases, i. e., from persons drawing a salary of 15 and 20 rupees, that have been, under some pretence or other, rejected. Whatever may be the explanation given—and I know what the explanation is; that is to say, that it is done in British India—you cannot give any moral justification for this action. That constitutes two wrongs. The fact that one government does a wrong thing is no excuse for you to do the same thing. I want this House to realise—and we are prepared to divide on this issue, but, as the party to which I belong do not like to treat this as a party question, under the direction of the leader, I confine myself to this point, and I do not wish to say anything more on this subject

Mr. K. S. Rama Ayyar.—Sir, I second the motion, and I stand on principle. I sincerely believe, and I press the point to the notice of the Government, that it is bad policy, why, even wrong policy, to provide out of the treasury, funds to the officers of the Government for their private purposes. For their service to the public, the officers are given salaries; when they have to move out of their offices, they get travelling allowances; and when in public interest they have to carry luggage, they are allowed tour charges. Besides these, in the case of a few people, I find such allowances as duty allowance, local allowance and even house allowance When they take leave, they get leave allowances, and finally when they leave service, they get their pension; and this is enough provision for the officers from the day on which they enter service to the day on which they die. I cannot admit that they have any claim on the public funds, *more* than any other subject of the State simply because they happen to be officers of the Government. But several officers seem to have obtained from the Government loans out of

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

the treasury for purchasing conveyances, for building houses and such other purposes which have all to be classed as private purposes. I should think this has become possible, because the borrowers stand on vantage ground, and have more influence with the Government than those who are not in Government service. The second reason for the creation and continuance of this practice is that Government are tempted to do such things, because they have surpluses with them, i. e., more money than what is required for the administration of the Government, and are sometimes at a loss to know what to do with them. I am against the practice of advancing loans to individuals from the State treasury funds, whether they are Government officers or not Government officers, unless the purpose of the loan is one which will help the material progress of the country (*Hear, hear*), whatever be the security offered, and whatever be the prospective profit out of such loans, as it is entirely wrong in principle from end to end. My point is that such loans as have been referred to do not serve any public purpose.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Sir, it is very difficult to decide what attitude should be taken regarding this motion, because there is one part of it where the action of the Government has to be condemned; but there is the other part in regard to which I cannot agree with the Progressive Party. It is always the duty of the employer to help the employee. Those who are employers—and my friend, the Member for Mattancheri, will bear out my statement—generally help their employees with loans even at very low rates of interest, where they find it necessary. But the cases have to be so carefully selected by the Government that the help rendered may be in fit cases. I cannot justify the action of the Government in rendering help in the case of persons whose names have been read out here by my friend, the Member for Irinjalakkuda. Left to myself, I would reject the petitions of all of them. But if there were proper securities in the cases which were rejected, I would certainly have recommended their being sanctioned. I do not know what prompted the Government to act in this topsy-turvy manner. They refuse grants where they are deserved, and sanction them where they are not deserved. Sir, is the necessity to get a car so pressing that the Government should grant loans? Government gains nothing by seeing their officers running about in cars. On the other hand there is the danger of the T. A. bill going up into large figures. If the Government do not help them in that direction, I believe the T. A. figures will go down.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

President.—But the time is economised.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—I beg to submit that, after the purchase of their cars, the administration of the departments has not improved a bit by the use of these cars. If the administration of the departments have remained as it was before, then I submit the cars have in no way affected the administration of the departments.

But, Sir, upon principle, I have to oppose this motion. There may arise cases where real help is necessary to the Government servants. All persons are not born rich. There may be deserving men in the service, who may be poor, and God alone knows when these men will fall into the hands of the money-lender. And Government will only be doing the right thing by saving them from their grip. In several cases persons inherit properties burdened with large debts, and they have to seek help to be free of these money-lenders. Therefore, let us not lay down such a policy as would drive Government servants, who are under real need, into the hands of the money-lenders. Therefore, upon principle, I have to oppose the motion.

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—On a point of information. Does this lending of money by the Government show that these officers are not in a position to provide themselves with conveyances ?

President.—No.

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—My point is, if that be so, I doubt whether they take loans from the Government at 6¼ per cent interest for the purpose of making a profit by investing it at 12 per cent interest.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We are not clear on the point. It is not a question of help to the officials. It is really investment of Government money under proper security.

President.—Then, the question will arise "why not you lend it to non-officials, who are prepared to give landed property as security" ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We are following what other civilized Governments are doing.

Mr. Sheik Abdul Qadir Sahib Bahadur.—Government officials are made to pay for the Provident Fund, for which only 4 per cent interest is paid to them, whereas the Government invests that money and gets greater interest. That point has also to be considered.

Dr.A.G. Menon.—All officers are not boundto subscribe for the Provident Fund. So all officers should not have claim then.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

President.—Have you anything to say, Dr. Verghese?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—*The British Account Code* lays it down that all Gazetted officers—all officers of above a certain pay—should be given loans for cars. It is laid down there.

President.—It was in Mr. Vijayaraghavachariar's time that this practice was begun.

The time minimised by the Heads of Departments by use of speedier conveyances is a gain to the Government, as they are able to devote greater attention to inspection work.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—They do not spend as much time as they were spending before.

Rao Sahib Mr. C. Matthai.—I inspected 12 schools, hereas, before—when I was using a *Judkka*—I was only able to inspect 2 schools.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—If they find a motor car is very convenient, let them pay for it out of their own pockets.

President.—You don't know the condition of Government officers. They are having a hand to mouth existence. Within the first five days of the month the whole amount of pay will be exhausted, and they have to borrow again.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—On a perusal of the list, one will see that low-paid officers are not given this help as in the case of Heads of Departments and officers drawing more than Rs. 300. Why this differentiation? Why did the Government refuse the request of the poor servants?

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—I support the motion on principle. At page 756 of Vol. III of the Proceedings, this identical question was put, and the answer is given on pages 762, 763 and 764. The list is given. Loans were given for purchasing conveyances and for purchasing house sites and for house construction

Now, the objection is two-fold. I take objection to advance, either for the purchase of conveyances or for the purchase of a house, on a matter of principle with which I will deal later on. Let us turn to *the Account Code*. Rule 246, Appendix R, in regard to the advance for the purchase of conveyances, is very clear.

Only touring officers are given this privilege, and if Government is satisfied that the general public welfare would be advanced thereby. In regard to house sites, and houses, section 10 speaks for itself. No advance is permissible, except to purchase and build at the place where he actually serves; where houses are not available or where house rent is exceptionally high, and recovery is to be made by deducting 1/48th of the loan amount from the pay (Rule 5).

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Briefly, the objection is that these rules have not been adhered to. In fact loans for the purchase of house sites were not granted at places where houses were not available. 'High' rent is of course a very vague term. So far as Cochin State is concerned, the 11 cases stated above do not come within the spirit of Appendix X in the *Account Code*. Similar advances have been made to officers for the purchase of conveyances, and the rule has been violated, for, this is only sanctioned in cases where public interest would be served thereby. The answer of the Government is that they were granted at their request and the Government did not worry itself to ascertain whether their financial condition was such, and whether any public interest would be served thereby or whether loans were absolutely necessary for the purposes intended. The pity of it is that they have been granted during the last 10 years even at times when the financial equilibrium of the State was unsatisfactory.

President.—Not for motor cars.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—The question covers a period of 10 years.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—From 1095 onwards only.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—Yes, for 7 years. This at a time when this money could have been utilised for better purposes *Administration Reports* from 1095 onwards show that allotments were not granted for useful objects to improve the lot of the people, because funds were not available. But we find loans are granted at 6¼% to officers, who could very well do without them. The differentiation in treatment pointed out by the Hon'ble Member for Irinjalakkuda also I take objection to.

Upon the answers given, I submit that it is not convincing that a motor car facilitates inspection work. It is often a mere pretext for drawing more T. A. If officers want to travel by car, they must make their own arrangements. They can very well hire or purchase a car and draw their T. A. Why look to the luxuries of the heavily paid officers? The system of administration is condemned as being top heavy.

The observation made by the Hon'ble Member for Chalakkudi that employers should help their employees has no manner of application here. The employer makes a gift of his own money. In this case the money which is taken from the poor people is given on loan to rich people, and they derive all sorts of conveniences. The poorer people of Cochin should be shown these special concessions. There is no justification for the advance of these amounts to persons who draw very handsome T. A. and fat salaries.

On principle, I would request Government to consider the justification for making such loans for the purpose of purchasing

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

conveyances and construction of house sites. I can understand money being lent to trade, to private associations formed for the improvement of any particular calling, industry or occupation in the interests of the people at large. I, for myself, absolutely fail to see why this convenience should be granted to high paid officers.

With these observations I disapprove of the practice present here, and I very strongly support the motion.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—You have not given any explanation for the differential treatment.

President.—In accordance with the rules laid down, which we have referred to already, loans are granted.

The motion was put to the votes and carried, 17 voting for and 15 against.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Any casting vote ?

President.—Only when there is an equality of votes, the President has got a casting vote.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—He gave his independent vote. When he said officials 13, it includes his name.

Motions Nos. 7 to 10.

VI—Legislative Council.

Establishment.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 2,925 for "Establishment" by one rupee.*

Legislative Council—Total.

Mr. Chakko Cheruvattur.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 15,815 for "Legislative Council" by rupees ten.*

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 15,815 for "Legislative Council" by one rupee.*

Dr. A. R. Menon.—*To omit the allotment of Rs. 15,815 for "Legislative Council."*

Dr. A. G. Menon.—I have a doubt. In 1102, "office expenses and miscellaneous" come to Rs. 700, while in 1101, it is only Rs. 400. That may be explained.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—The sum of Rs. 400 in 1101 is for two items put together, and the sum of Rs. 700 in 1102 is for three items put together. The excess sum of Rs. 300 is for the purchase of a typewriting machine for the Legislative Council Office.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—I move to reduce the allotment for "Establishment" by rupee one. The matter on which I desire to speak is this, namely, to get the price of the Council Proceedings reduced to that of in Travancore and in British India, and

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

for the general information of the public the proceedings of the Council should be published in the Government Gazette.

President.—Is it done in Travancore?

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—No, Sir.

President.—In Madras also, it is not done.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—But the price there is only two annas. Here it is four annas.

President.—That may be considered.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—That is the main object. For wider publicity, it is very necessary that they should be given every facility. All the Municipal Proceedings are published in the Gazette.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—May I know whether Government have agreed to reduce the price of the Council Reports?

President.—The question of the reduction of price will be considered. There will be no harm in reducing it to two annas.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—Could not the Government publish the Proceedings in the Gazette as a supplement?

President.—I have not considered that question.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—I desire to avail mysel of this token motion to express our appreciation of the meritorious work done by its energetic Secretary and the staff under him. We would, on our part, request the Government that their services may be better appreciated, and that they may be amply and liberally remunerated. I also desire to put in a plea on behalf of the shorthand reporters here who, although they began rather badly, have considerably improved themselves, and deserve much better remuneration than they do at present. We realise their difficulties, and we have been observing that they have improved admirably well.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Is it the party's considered opinion?

Dr. A. G. Menon.—The party refuses to answer.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, last year I brought to the notice of the Government the position of the Secretary of this House. I am glad, Sir, in the course of this year, the case of the Registrar of the Chief Court has been considered, and his emoluments increased. In the case of Krishna Ayyar it was done, but in the case of Krishna Menon, it was not done, and so, I renew the plea.

President.—Why do you make reference to Krishna Ayyar, Krishna Menon, &c.? You could as well have said without any reference to his name, "why it should be done only to the Registrar of the Chief Court?" Government are guided by certain considerations in all these matters. It may be that you

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

don't see eye to eye with the Government. That is another matter.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—We don't know the merits of the case. We are not aware of it. The Registrar's case was brought to the notice of this House, and his case has been considered.

President.—The Registrar's case was decided long before the matter was brought to the notice of this House.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The work that is being turned out is heavy, and is growing, and it is almost a full-timed officer's work now. But nevertheless all the work is done, and his pay is not increased.

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—The work that is turned out by the Secretary is so tiresome that no other man of his capacity can do it for Rs. 150. If you offer any other man of his capacity he will not come and accept it for this Rs. 150. It is an absolute necessity that his pay must be increased.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—I am very sorry that our position has been so reduced that each one of us gets up and says that such and such a person's pay should be increased. Is it our function here? Is it our duty here to say that each man's pay should be increased.

President.—They said about the pay of an office. The pay of the Secretary's office should be increased. That is what they said.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—What about the Vyttila Member's speech to increase the pay of a Lady Doctor?

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—Not because I mean that Mr. Krishna Menon's pay should not be increased, but I feel sorry that our position has been so reduced. This will appear in print unfortunately. It will appear that each one of us said such and such an individual is hard-working, and he should be given somthing extra. If we are reduced to that stage, I don't know what our position would be.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—We were reduced to some other stage, abusing a person for half an hour. The Hon'ble Member was criticising here the treatment meted out to a particular officer, and charging a particular officer of the Government for being partial in his treatment of an officer, and a censure motion was moved. If that can be done, why not speak on the merits also?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Is there any motion before the House?

President.—It is being dicussed, and other speakers wish to say something.

As regards the matter under discussion, I am of opinion that personal references should be avoided, as far as possible. We are here in accordance with the rules of the Council law to refer to matters of public concern and not to cases of individual

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

merit. So it would be out of place to say that such and such an officer's pay should be increased.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—We don't put it in that way.

President.—The Finance Committee is considering the whole question. I don't know whether discussing questions like these—he is drawing higher pay, the administration is top-heavy, he should be given nore pay—comes within the purview of the Legislative Council. So I ask the members not to make personal references.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Top-heavy administration. Is it objectionable ?

President.—You mentioned the meritorious service rendered by the Secretary. You may refer to Munsiffs, Tahsildars or Police Sub-Inspectors. Any of these individual cases may be taken. I do not consider it is a matter of public concern to say with reference to a particular officer that the emoluments given to that officer will not be sufficient. The Special Finance Committee is considering the matter. Government will have to pass orders thereon.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—If you rule like that, I have no objection. We have put it together.

President.—When you put it together, it is difficult to dissociate the office from the person holding it.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I will have to speak more of it when the cut comes. Officers should not be in this House. I will tell you my difficulties.

President.—That is going out of the province of the Council. Officers are here by statute, and I cannot understand how you can say that officers should not be here.

The House rose for lunch at 2 p. m. It re-assembled at 3 p. m.

President.—We were discussing motion No. 7 standing in the name of Mr. K. T. Mathew.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—I don't press it, Sir.

President.—I must then put it to the vote of the House to see whether he has the leave to withdraw the motion.

The motion to withdraw was put to vote and carried.

President.—Motion No. 8, Mr. Chakko Cheruvattur.

Mr. Chakko Cheruvattur.—I want to have some information. I want to know what was done with my resolution regarding holidays. I had already written to the Diwan about it. But I did not get any reply. A resolution was passed with regard to certain Christian holidays.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—It is being considered.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I will ask one or two points. There are now one or two Jews in the service. Now, Saturday is a recog-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

nised holiday to the Jews. But in some offices, I think that they are not aware of it. I request that a circular may be sent to all the offices and the Municipalities, bringing to their notice that Saturday is a Jewish holiday.

President.—Does any officer insist on their attending office on Saturday ?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—A case has reached my ears. So a cirular may be issued.

Mr. Chakko Cheruvattur.—With regard to my question, may I know what is the delay ?

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Final orders have not been passed.

President.—In what state is it now ? It is quite unsatisfactory to say that everything is under consideration.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—We are getting information from Travancore as to what is being done there. We have not got any information till now.

President.—We may refer the matter to the Archbishop and request him to help us in the matter.

Mr. Chakko Cheruvattur.—It is nearly five months since it is passed. Other resolutions which have been passed have already come into force.

President.—In regard to Mr. Salem's request, it seems to be an important matter.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Yes, Sir.

President.—With regard to Mr. Salem's case, it has been noted. Next motion, No. 9. Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—I withdraw Sir.

The motion was taken as withdrawn.

President.—Motion No. 10. Dr. A. R. Menon.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—The object of this cut motion is to call attention to the inability of this Council to discharge the proper and legitimate function expected of it with the present limited power conferred on it. Sir, it was my intention originally to move a total cut for the legislature, so that the legislature may end automatically. But the party leaders thought that such an extreme step is uncalled for, and directed me only to confine myself to a token motion. Obeying the instructions of the majority of the party, I have tabled a token motion. Sir, in moving this motion, I will crave your indulgence to extend to me a little more time than I am actually entitled to, and I am happy to find that all such appeals have always been met with your kind response. We, on the other hand, undertake to expedite the work as far as possible and as far as it lies within our power.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

It was my business to call attention last year to the inefficient supervision exercised by the Diwan over the Heads of Departments. This year we wish to call attention of this House to the respective positions in which the executive presided over by the Diwan (who also happens to be the President of this Council) and those of us who represent the constituencies in this Council are placed. I have briefly touched in my introductory budget speech on the difficulties that will arise in a Council which is divided into an executive being and a legislative being. We know that the executive always remains as the executive, and the legislature always remains the same. I have always pointed out that an irremovable executive will produce an irresponsible opposition, and an irresponsible criticism will only create heart-burning and a spirit of animosity towards those who indulge in such criticisms, and the next result will be a gulf, which will widen more and more, and a state of affairs will arise, when the Council, instead of conferring benefit upon the people, will be a source of annoyance and irritation to our own people and to the Government.

In order that such a contingency should not arise, I gave a total cut, but now, this year, we call the attention of the Government to the existing disabilities, just to express our inability to do the work that is entrusted to us by the constituencies and also, I believe, by His Highness the Maharaja of Cochin. When we bring a charge like this against the Government, he, who takes the responsibility of bringing a motion of this serious nature must realise the grave step he takes, and he must be in a position to substantiate all the charges that he makes. I shall, with your leave, bring in three or four concrete examples before this House, so that the House and the public at large may judge whether we are right in our expression of opinion, so far as the work in this Council is concerned. During the last 18 months, when I was a Member of this Council, I remember a number of resolutions had been passed, a number of resolutions thrown out and a number of resolutions accepted by Government and passed unanimously. I shall confine myself to those resolutions which had been accepted by the Government. In the first place, some of them were carried by a few non-official majority. You all remember that nearly a year ago a resolution was tabled here by my friend, the Hon'ble Member for Kunnamkulam, calling upon the Government the necessity to establish an Ayurvedic institution, and remarkably enough, the Government, instead of offering an opposition, joined with us and blessed the movement. What happened then? The institution did not come into existence. I remember very well the words used. They said that the Government is in sympathy

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

with it, but it is a question of funds. That is one thing. I shall show how funds have been multiplied.

In the same way we called attention last year to the location of the College. We did not say whether the college should be at Ernakulam or at Trichur, but entered an emphatic protest. I used mild words against the public funds being wasted. They considered the problem as a whole, and we pointed out to the Government that the time had come when the Government should either stop any further work at Ernakulam or must decide upon it once for all. In that division we were beaten, and the Government won by one vote, because the President gave his casting vote. A year passed. We received a number of resolutions and the same result followed. Government was not able to give us any answer, and the Chief Engineer came forward and told us that, had he been able to confine all his attention to the question of water supply at Anappara, he would have been able to give a reply within three months. But he was asked to go to Tannikkudam and other places to try schemes involving an expenditure of one million rupees, and naturally he pleaded his inability—and in our opinion rightly too—and said that this work required more than three or four months' time. Now, Sir, that is another opinion of this Council. Then, the Forest budget was placed before this House; the Special Finance Committee made certain recommendations. Those recommendations were not accepted—of course, Government are at liberty not to accept them. But the budget was presented involving a large expenditure, which the Government approved, and which we are not able to explain. We have no objection to make representations here, provided the gentlemen on the opposite side are in a position to listen to it. There is no use of our coming here and presenting arguments and your listening to all those arguments and automatically voting against them. I call this House to witness whether on any occasion, a case that we have presented met with a real argument on the other side. They never argue, but they simply think that they have power to vote, and they have voted accordingly. Well, a similar spirit of opposition will arise in this House, and what I thought has actually happened. The fourth resolution—an irrigation motion—a most important motion in an agricultural country like ours—was submitted to the House by my friend representing Nellayi. The motion was carried by this House, and the Government later on rejected that motion, and gave certain explanations in the Gazette, the purport of which I was not able to understand till this moment. Similarly, the Government has been using

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

the Special Finance Committee for certain purposes to suit their own conveniences. To accept a measure also the Committee's opinion has been urged. I call attention to the proposal submitted by the Chief Engineer in relation to paying wards. The report was submitted after a careful study. At last, in the process of submission, the whole thing was exhaustively enquired into, and we definitely made a proposal that, in regard to the paying ward at Ernakulam, it must receive the serious consideration of the Government before that work is undertaken. Trichur being the central place and nearly three-fourths of the population being in 30 miles around the hospital, it will receive more of our people than at Ernakulam. But, Sir, forgive me for making this observation, for it seems to me that all motives and objects underlying this only seem to be in the interest and convenience of certain Heads of Departments. Now, Sir, there must be some purpose served by our coming here. The leader of the party on the opening day raised certain points. I entirely—in my humble opinion, without impertinence—endorsed the view expressed that he could not proceed with his speech. And then, we asked you how we could get redress, and you gave an answer that some methods must be found out by public meeting or public addresses or even by approaching His Highness the Maharaja. We, the party, thought that the most logical and reasonable method of expressing publicly our protest and also of calling attention not only of this Council but also of our people outside in constitutional way, is to raise the issue in the discussion of motions on " the general administration," and thereby dividing this House to see how we stand and where we stand. I do not blame the Government for this state of affairs. On our part also, we have got a grave offence. Sir, it is the duty of all non-officials to join together in all essentials, while we are at liberty to differ in non-essentials. I cannot admit, and I do not pretend that we have been able to do so till this time. But time is gradually changing, and the time has come when either this Council is going to be forced upon the State or this Council is going to die. We have never asked for this Council, so far as I know. There has never been any protest or public meeting calling upon His Highness to introduce this Council.

Mr. C. Achyuta Menon.—There were 17 public meetings.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I know all these public meetings. There were certain public meetings convened by an association which itself has died now.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

During the last 6 or 7 years, at any rate, there has never been any agitation for this Council. All at once the Government comes forward, and says " We are going to have a Legislative Council ". I say, if you are going to have a Legislative Council, you should be prepared to appreciate its views in all reasonable projects. Few, in my opinion, think that we have got any power, and a feeling of power always gives a man a feeling of superiority, a feeling that he is the master of all he surveys. With that spirit you are going to work this Council. We are unable to carry on the work, as the leader of the party has shown, because of the various interpretations of the Council law in a narrow spirit. We had called in question the rulings of the President. The net result of these rulings is to restrict what little power we possess in this House, and our intention is to call the attention of this House and our people that we are failing in our duty, which we anticipated we would be able to carry on in this Council. I may also tell the non-official Members of this House—whether members of this party or the other party—that, in all essential things, we must unite together and oppose the official block. But, while destiny turns round and round, that party will be in our hands, and nothing will prevent the achievement of that day. But the moral support we are lending to this Council by our association with them, I submit, has increased the executive power of the Government, since the introduction of this Legislative Council. This Council means the checking and controlling of the power of the executive without actually adding one more power, and hence, in its indifferent insolence, the Members of this Council are treated as though they are dirty dogs.

President.—I object to this expression.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I dissented this morning, because the President said that certain allegations were made. You must call upon me to prove this allegation or the Head of the Department must be asked to apologise. Do you mean to say that I am an irresponsible man? The Hon'ble Member for the Anglo-Indians may be referred to. He will be able to tell you that all these statements made in the report are true. Therefore, I say that, if you are going to treat us in a spirit of co-operation, then that spirit will be reciprocated.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—Sir, the mover of this motion, the Member for Irinjalakkuda, has recounted, in his usually eloquent style, many charges of omission and commission on the part of the present head of the administration as well as the President of this Council. It is not my purpose to enter into the details of these various items and pronounce a verdict, though reference to me in his speech compels me to speak a few words by

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

way of explanation. Sir, the Member for Irinjalakkuda pointed out that he, as well as myself, as members of the Sub-Committee for the inspection of Hospitals, had occasion to go to the various Hospitals of the State, and on these occasions, as a result of our close investigation, we found that the medicines supplied to those Hospitals were not sufficient, and that the staff of many of them was undermanned. Sir, this is the point which has to be looked into very carefully, and I hope I shall not be misunderstood, if I congratulate the Government that, in this year's budget, special allotments have been made to increase the quantity of medicines and to increase the number of nurses and menial servants, though I must at the same time state that much has to be done in this direction as well as in several other governmental activities.

As regards the other points of omission and commission that have been referred to regarding your decisions in this House as President, all that I have to say is that I am not surprised that you have interfered with the decisions of the Council, but what I am surprised at is that you have not interfered too often. The Regulation and the Rules under which the Council functions and operates are so drawn up that you have extensive powers, you have considerable latitude, and Sir, I congratulate you that you have not made further interference. But, Sir, as a Member representing the Progressive Party, I must say that it is high time that further instalments of reforms are granted to the popular side, so that no Member on this side may have occasion to criticise the action of the Government.

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—It is not known whether he is opposing or supporting.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—I am not ungrateful to what has been conferred on the people of the State. If I remember right, it was during the regime of our Ex-Highness—that sagacious and talented intellect of whom any country and any time may be proud—that the impulse for a system of popular administration on a proper basis was first experienced. He gave expression to the need, and he took the initiative in that direction. Sir, the example set by him was followed by our benign Highness, the present Maharaja, and the result is to-day we have got the First Council in the State in accordance with the political atmosphere of all civilised countries, and here we have sounded a note of gentle warning. I am one of those who believe that, after giving a margin to that part of the sovereign power which has been surrendered to the Paramount Power, the reserve power which is left belongs to His Highness, and whatever has been given us, was given out of his free will and not anything which we can wrest out of His Highness. I use the word "wrest"

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

purposely. All that I request for is that the very same regime may be pleased to grant us a further instalment of reforms which will enable the Second Council to work in a more useful manner and in a manner which posterity—the generations which are yet to come—will be thankful for, (*Hear, hear.*)

Before concluding, I wish to make one more observation, and I shall not be found guilty of being a faddist, when I say that, when this Council was about to be inaugurated, the community which I represent had requested His Highness' government that we may be given a special constituency. We find the Jewish community given a special constituency. Of course, I am glad that, though we did not get a special constituency, they got one. So we requested that we should also be given the privilege of nomination. At that time the constituencies of Chittur, Tattamangalam and the Jews wanted each a member. I also requested. They got each a seat. They will get each a seat next year also. I now once again submit that our old request may be sympathetically considered.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Though the speech of the Hon'ble Member for the Anglo-Indians has gone a great distance to cloud the real issue, I take it that we are on this that the Legislative Council of the State should be one that is possessed of real powers, (*Hear, hear*)—powers which will enable it to check the executive from time to time as occasions arise. (*Hear, hear.*) I am at one with the mover in that, and I heartily support this motion. But, Sir, the Council as now constituted, besides being one with very limited powers, is not really representative of the people. I refer to the franchise that has now been extended to the people. It is my point that the franchise as now extended is very limited, and is capable of further extension in comparison with our sister States and other provinces by the side of us. Large powers must be given to this Council. As remarked by the Member for Irinjalakkuda and conclusively proved by him, whatever we pass here are mere resolutions, and they end there. The executive is not at all checked by our opinion. What we want is that the executive should not be allowed to go astray where, in regard to the resolutions referred to by the Member for Irinjalakkuda, there is absolutely no reason to think that the Council have in any way gone wrong; yet the Government have not thought it fit to give effect to those resolutions. We want such a Council which can force its opinions on the Government and can see that its opinions are respected and acted upon. The Council must have the power to stop supply to the Government. That is what we want.

Sir, one word about a seat that has been recently abolished. I refer to the seat for "Commerce and Industry." I may, in this

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

connection, refer to question No. 155 answered to-day. I am not quite satisfied with the answer. I am afraid it is not correct. After all, the answer is based on approximation. Even then, it shows that we get only 21 millions of *paras* of paddy and our annual consumption is 33 and odd millions of *paras*. They have not deducted from this 21 millions of *paras* of paddy, the quantity that is exported from the State. Almost all the paddy from the Chittur Taluk is exported to British India except what is used for the consumption by the land owners. From the Trichur Taluk large quantities are exported to the plantations in Travancore; so that all the 21 millions—the total estimated production of the State—is not consumed in the State. Now, it comes to this: that a part of the 33·6 millions of *paras* of paddy that is consumed every year, and more than three quarters is imported into the State by merchants. And what have you done to them? You have abolished the only seat that had been granted to Commerce and Industry. I would say that one seat is not enough but that there should be more. The first draft had given a better franchise to Commerce and Industry, but that was changed and a proclamation was issued at the time of Diwan Mr. Narayana Menon whereby the franchise that had been intended to be extended to Commerce and Industry was curtailed, confining it to certain factories and companies. I plead on behalf of that large and useful number employed in Commerce and Industry. In point of contribution to the development of the State they compare very favourably with our agriculturists. I plead on their behalf, and in doing so, I really plead on behalf of the citizens of the State. I say it is high time to cancel the order that has been passed and to restore to Commerce and Industry the seat they have lost.

President.—There should be some clear view about it. It was considered very carefully. Have you got special seats, for Education, for Agriculture, etc.? The case for Commerce and Industry is also like that. If it were only to represent an association like the Chamber of Commerce I can very well understand your position. Suppose I have a Government Member for Commerce and Industry, then will you be satisfied?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—May I explain that point? We have been following other States in several matters. In Travancore there are two seats for Commerce and Industry.

President.—That fact was not unnoticed.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—The scheme we prepare for representation should be one that would enable us to get at the views of as many as possible. A referendum is not practicable, and I do not know whether it is desirable to have it just now. Our only

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

concern is whether the electors are respectable, and whether they are capable of having views of their own. But we now see whether they pay any tax—and we have fixed the minimum tax at Rs. 10. Are not the merchants in the State, who contribute largely to the Sirkar treasuries respectable men? Then why do you not take their opinions? Why should they be excluded from this category of electors? Traders and commercial men have their own views. For what reason do you shut out their views in the scheme of representation that you have prepared? There should not be any provision which will keep out a large number of men with views of their own and contributing large amounts to the Sirkar treasuries. You have given a special seat for the Jews and two for the Ezhuvas. Why? Because when you examined the votes you found that very few of them were represented. Therefore, to get at their views you gave them special seats. A special seat has been given to planters. All the Municipalities have separate seats. These special seats and special votes are meant not only to represent special interests but the real scheme is to get at the views of those classes of people who will otherwise stand shut out. And so the seat for Commerce and Industry was devised to procure the views of the commercial classes and of industrialists, who are the real back-bone of Cochin, which is soon to have a highly developed harbour.

Mr. C. Matthai.—Sir, with your leave, I shall speak a few words. I have not come prepared with the object of making a speech, but while listening to the speakers on the other side, some points have struck me, and with your leave, I shall briefly touch on them, of course, confining myself to matters connected with my department.

President.--Why can't you speak generally? You have been in the Government service for a long time, and you know how it has been functioning, and why should you confine yourself to your department alone? Why are you so practial in your views? (*Hear, hear.*)

Mr. C. Matthai.—The parts put together would form the whole; and if I represent my part, and the others represent their parts, then the whole is represented.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—If all the 12 Members are going to speak that will take more than one hour.

President.—I cannot allow each Member to speak about his department.

Mr. C. Matthai.—I think what I am going to say has direct relation to my department, but it will be general also.

Well, the first question raised was about the location of the college. The Member for Irinjalakkuda, you will remem-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

ber, Sir, when he raised the question the other day, began his arguments by saying "we are determined to press this motion to a division; we are determined that Government should be driven to certification this time". Well, when a Member begins his speech like that, it is no exaggeration to say that arguments will not prevail. He has taken it as a party question, and he is determined to take up an attitude of opposition and he is also determined to have a majority on his side. If a party has come to that understanding, such an attitude is not one of reason, and this side has no hopefulness that it would be able to convert the other side.

Then, Sir, he said just now that a strong position of opposition was laid before Government—arguments were placed before Government—and Government had no answer to give. I ask you, Sir, is that a statement of facts? Have we not reasons to give? And then he referred to the report of the Chief Engineer, and said that, if the Chief Engineer had been asked to investigate this particular question, the whole thing would have been decided in two or three months. If the Member, who raised this question, had read the report of the College Committee that is in print—I happened to be the President of that Committee, the Member for Mulakunnattukavu was Secretary, and there were other members—he would have seen that, in proposing the transfer of the college to Anappara, we said that one object we had in view was to provide for a great need in our country, viz., higher agricultural training. And we advocated Anappara because we found there were facilities, but the main consideration to decide was whether we would have an adequate supply of water. This aspect of the question is quite clear in that report, and I have been emphasising that. Then, time and again, we are told that Government are not in a position to solve the question of water supply to the First Grade College, and so on and so on. There, I think the arguments adduced from the other side are not very strong, and I must be forgiven for saying that the attitude of the opposition, in approaching this question, is not one of reasonableness.

And then, it was said, after all, what has the Government done; it has flouted the opinion of this Council, and Government won by the casting vote of the President. I suppose the President of the Council is as much a Member as any other Member of this House, and he has a right to exercise his vote. They cannot accuse us of flouting the opinion of this House, because that motion was lost.

And then three or four other points were raised in support of the contention that we were determined on disregarding the expression of opinion of the majority of this House. Well, I

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

shall refer to a few points connected with education. There was a resolution moved regarding compulsory education of the depressed classes. Then we explained the attitude of the Government, and we said that, since there was a strong feeling on this question, we should do all we could, and we were prepared to make special efforts to encourage the education of the depressed classes. On that assurance, the Member withdrew his motion, and what is the result to-day, Sir? That was about 2 years ago, when I said we were going to make special efforts. Those who have read the report of this department for last year (1101) would see that from 1,000 the number increased to 4,000 and odd. Is that not ample progress made, Sir? Is that not carrying out the wishes of this House, Sir? And then, to-day—I am not in full possession of the figures—from the figures I have received so far, the number of pupils of depressed classes have already exceeded 7,000. The total school-going population of depressed classes would be somewhere about 15,000. Out of this 15,000 depressed class pupils, 7,000 are attending schools. Is there any province in India that can show a percentage of this kind? (*Hear, hear.*)

And then, Sir, about the disabilities of the depressed classes in regard to admission to schools. The Members, time and again, brought to our notice that there were so many schools which were closed against the depressed classes. We have steadily been throwing open all these schools. Where do we stand now? There is not a Government school in the whole State which is now closed against the depressed classes (*Hear, hear.*)

Dr. A. G. Menon.—That point was not raised now, Sir.

Mr. C. Matthai.—It was heard frequently in this House that it was a great hardship.

And then, Sir, about spinning. There was a resolution about spinning, and the resolution was accepted in the Council. What is it that we find now? Last year, I said there were 60 schools where spinning was carried on. That was as a result of 4 months' work. And to-day there are more than 200. If I say 250, that would be nearer the mark. That is out of less than 600. That is the result of a year and a half of work.

And then the question of temperance. That was urged in this House, and we said we would do all we could to make it a subject of instruction in schools. Instructions have been issued to all schools regarding that, so that it is now a part of the curriculam of instruction in schools. (*Hear, hear.*)

And then, about cosmopolitan hostels. The House was in sympathy with the proposition, and as desired by the Members, we have introduced the experiment in Kunnamkulam and

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

we are watching its progress. We have committed ourselves to that line of policy. (*Hear, hear.*)

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Sir, in the course of the general discussion of the budget, the Member for Chalakkudi alleged that restrictions and interferences were made by Government on the freedom of religious worship of the Jews, Muslims and Christians. What he said was, if I remember right, that inroads had latterly been made by the Government on the age-long freedom of the citizen in the matter of public worship, and that it had become much of uphill work to obtain sanction to erect a place for it. Such a statement is calculated to mislead the House and the public. The policy of the Government has always been to afford every help in this direction. If, in any exceptional case, such sanction had been refused, it was solely because the construction of new places of worship, too near the seats of worship of other communities, may bring such communities into conflict, and may tend to create communal friction and breach of public peace. Such contingencies have to be guarded against. It is solely for such a purpose that sanction is insisted on. From what I have been able to gather so far, during the last 19 years, there were applications for permission to erect

28	churches
22	Christian cemeteries
10	temples
6	mosques

and 3 Muhammadan cemeteries making in all a total of 69 applications. Of these, permission was refused after enquiry for 2 churches and 1 mosque ; that is 3 out of 69. All the remaining 66 were sanctioned.

I leave it to the House to decide how far the alleged inroad into the right of freedom of public worship is correct.

Regarding loans, etc., high officials who have taken loans from Government are not many. They are few in number. It is chiefly for providing themselves with conveyances to do their touring work more efficiently and quickly that such loans have been obtained. It is in a way in the interests of Government work too. It is largely those who are in the subordinate service that have taken such loans. The rate of interest in all these cases is 6½ per cent. This is not below the current market rate. The bank rate is seldom steady, and has seldom been above this. The present bank rate is even below 4 per cent for investment. I do not see anything wrong in helping Government servants with small loans when the advance is secure, and when a reasonable rate of interest is vouchsafed. No employer will deny such assistance, if he could render it.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Regarding the Legislative Council, the success or failure of the Council depends on its Members. So far I do not think the Council has been a failure. Speeches not bound on true data will tend to mar the good name of a Council, and ultimately lead to wreck it. If sobriety and good sense are brought to prevail upon the deliberations of the Council, if each and every constituent of the Council will closely adhere to the Rules and Regulations and adopt the principles laid down, any system can be worked to benefit and prosperity, however limited its scope is. It is only by proving our fitness to work what is given that we can expect more. If the Council is worked to a failure, then it is a waste of public money. If it is worked to success, then the limitations will be gradually narrowed. This depends on the good sense and the mutual trust and co-operation of the Members of the House. The Council is a gift of His Highness the Maharaja to the people, and it is, therefore, the bounden duty of all to show that it was well merited and that more is deserved.

During the course of the general discussion, it was remarked by some that the limited powers allowed to the Council were not permitted to be exercised, that Standing Orders were not observed, that the rules were interpreted in a narrow spirit and so on. These are, I regret, unfounded allegations, and as a matter of fact, the Council has been allowed a wider and more liberal latitude than a strict interpretation of the rules would permit.

Again, constitutional reforms formed a subject of topic by almost every Member. The proposals were for the enhancement of the powers and privileges of this Council. It means the modification of the present Legislative Council Regulation and Rules. This is a subject which we are prohibited from discussing, and I, therefore, leave it alone:

Scant consideration shown to the importance of Commerce and Industry in the State.

This is not really a fact. Commerce and Industry are as important to Government as any other subject, and at no time any discouragement has been shown to these. Every Member in the Council can work for the development of Commerce and Industry. In fact almost every department of Government is contributing in some manner or other for the promotion of Commerce and Industry. Lands are assigned for industrial cultivation. Facilities exist for opening mills and factories. Co-operation helps to promote and accelerate Commerce and Industry. Government have advanced loans to some of the industrial concerns in the State. Forests and Tramway are purely

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

commercial concerns. Our customs revenue indicates the extent of commercial business that is going on. Industrial and commercial education are imparted in several of the State schools. The Railway is purely a commercial concern. The P. W. Department contributed much to promote commerce by opening up roads and canals. And lastly, the Economic Development Committee is expected to give a further impetus to Commerce and Industry.

If, however, what the Member has in his mind is the abolition of the Special Constituency of "Commerce and Industry" for election purposes from the Second Council onwards, it is pointed out that a discussion on the point is outside the province of this Council, and Government had sufficient justification for the step taken.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, this is the most important discussion in this session, and we are discussing the point of the progressive realization of responsible Government. (*Hear, hear.*) As the time at my disposal is limited, I will characterise that, in our endeavour to reach the goal of the progressive realization of responsible Government, we have been rapidly, progressively, realising the helpless condition in which we are, and we have been going towards irresponsibility. I regret, Sir, that the laudable intentions with which this first step was taken and this self-governing institution has been ushered into existence are not realised. We have four kinds of powers given to us. The first power is the power of interpellation. That has been curtailed by rules and by the sections and it has also been further curtailed by Government taking one attitude and the President taking another attitude. It has also been curtailed by means of what we say the official President's natural interpretation of things, because the official garb of the Diwan is there, and nobody can enable him to get out of it And then, Sir, the second power we have got is the power of passing resolutions. No self-governing institution has any power of resolutions, if it has not got the where-withals to enforce its resolution. When resolutions become recommendatory, it is only as any newspaper criticism, well-reasoned and placed before the Government. No self-governing institution is worth its name, if in its self-governing powers, it passes a resolution, and is unable to enforce it. (*Hear, hear.*) Therefore, the two powers are curtailed, and this is what I meant by the realisation towards irresponsibility. Then the third power is the power of discussing the budget. What do you mean by discussing the budget? It means to vote or not vote. You have here, Sir, a large amount of money which is not votable. "Voting" means supplying, and that means granting the money. Is there one Gov-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

ernment Member in this House, who sits here in this House and expects his salary to be voted by this House? Every Government Member that sits here is quite sure that his salary is quite safe, and is not even votable by this House. Therefore, they are absolutely secure in their position and do not remain here upon the vote of the people. This is a very sad condition of affairs. Now, here is a Legislative Council cut. What is our constitutional right to-day? You ask us "Give us money to carry on the Legislative Council like this". We say "this is the present condition of our Legislative Council, and we are not prepared to give you the money to carry on such a council. If we are given the full power to give you this grant and we do not do so, than the cuncil will come to an end. But you have the power to certify and carry on this council, if it serves your purpose, and we, by doing so, will only stultify ourselves. We, the legislature, is the creation of the Sovereign of the country. I would ask your indulgence to hear me when I say that the legislature always comes as a result of the conjunction of the Sovereign with the people. That first born child is the legislature. It has got two hands maid—namely, the judiciary and the executive. The judiciary is to interpret what it legislates, and the executive is to carry out the mandates of the legislature. What is it here?

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—All these are first principles.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—They are not understood. Therefore, such councils come into existence. What is it here? We have not anything of that sort. What is the promise of our Gracious Highness? His Highness' most laudable promise was that, in an increasing measure, we will be given wider powers and liberal practical franchise. What is the practical franchise we have got? We have got only two per cent of the people who possess the franchise, and we have got the high ten rupee qualification. We have no adult suffrage. That is a very sad state of affairs. We want more liberal electorates and more liberal powers conferred on us.

In the opening speech of the budget discussion, the first attempt of our leader was to show how, by interpretations, that have already been passed in the Council, we are not able to function as liberally as we could. What was the result? I am not blaming any one. The rules are perfectly interpreted. Suppose the rules were not interpreted in this way, then our leader would not have had the necessity to come here after three years' work, and say that a progressive curtailment of the powers of the House has taken place. Such a charge would not have been placed before this House. This

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

is the result of not having this declaration of His Highness perfectly in view. What is the kind of legislature we have? It is only the result of a topsy-turvy idea. The true idea is the executive must always be controlled by the legislature. But you think the time is not ripe for it, and the executive must, therefore, be given full powers, and the legislature must be given only the powers of a critic to mould it by opinion, not by resolutions, only by opinion. I do not say that you have flouted our opinions. I am glad that the Hon'ble Member for Education has stood up and said "We are far from flouting opinion, but we have gone as far as we could to respect your opinion." I perfectly agree with him, but you have flouted many resolutions of this House—that is the case. Resolutions have been passed, and they have been relegated to the limbo of oblivion. That is the case. For instance, I shall mention one resolution—a most important resolution, to spend a lakh of rupees for irrigation purposes. What happened?

President.—No such resolution was passed in this House; but Mr. Ramachandra Ayyar moved a resolution that two lakhs must be ear-marked for irrigation purposes, and that was not carried. But there was one about the appointment of a committee.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—People are interested in having irrigation; they asked for a committee. And what happened? I am not blaming anybody. I am blaming only the system under which we are labouring. It is nobody's fault. We want to bring the defects prominently in view and to express our views, and His Gracious Highness is to redress our grievances. He is our father, and we are his children, and we are sure when the children cry for milk, milk will be forthcoming. That is the reason why we are telling all these things. We are not cringing for power. When you limit freedom of speech by whatever means possible, we are precluded from opening our mouths, and many restrictions are imposed upon us by the Regulation itself. You give us a Council, tie our mouths and ask us to speak out openly; one half of the lip is stitched and how can we open our mouths fully? We are thankful to you for having done so much, but the surprise is that the rules are not interpreted, as the Hon'ble Member for the Anglo-Indians said, more strictly. That is the surprise. There is no sign wanting in Cochin's culture. See our officers here. We have got 12 officers who carry on the every day administration here, and who come every day in touch with the people. They come here and receive all the criticisms levelled against them in this House, sometimes in bad language, sometimes in parliamentary

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

language, sometimes a little out of the way, because we are all new to the system, but with all that, they are able to rise out of the attacks in the House and still carry on as impartially as they could the administration. (*Hear, hear.*) Is it not human feeling, to oppose persons who, by means of down-right criticisms, affect their official career? Is it not human feeling to retaliate? That is the very reason why, in all civilized Governments, and in all Governments where self-governing institutions exist, the Government is kept quite apart from its servants. This is a servant-master Government. Servants are here to represent the Government. In popularly governed countries the minister may be abused and a vote of censure may be passed, and he may go out of office, and some other gentleman may be appointed as minister, yet the Government officers who are in charge of the every day administration of the State are unruffled, unaffected by these changes inside the House. We passed a vote of censure on a particular head of a department here. What happened? If he were a minister, he would not be here. The relations of the head of the department with the gentleman who moved the vote of censure upon his minister cannot be in the least affected by the turn of events in the House. But what will be the case here?

President.—Was there any regular vote of censure?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Yes, against the head of the Excise Department.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—It was stated in the course of the speech.

President.—If it is a vote of censure, it is unconstitutional.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—It was not from our party that it was moved.

President.—Whichever party it is, the Members have no right to move a vote of censure or a vote of non-confidence against Government officers.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Is it so? But I was not sitting here hearing that. I was not in the House. I was sitting in the President's gallery to hear it. I am only telling you that if such mud is thrown, is it not human weakness to retaliate? To avoid all these things, we want another system to be introduced in your time, so that you, a son of the soil, can partake of the credit of having advanced our little State towards the real realisation of progressive Government with self-governing institutions.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Sir, I only want to offer a few remarks. Some special reference has been made to certain things which relate to my department, which requires some explanation.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

President.—Reference has been made to the working of the department many a time, and explanations have been furnished many a time, and you are going to say you want time to explain it further. Why can't you offer some general remarks, about the Legislative Council, its usefulness, how far it is functioning its duties in accordance with the privilege conferred on it? Why do you confine yourself to your department alone? If you will allow me, I shall speak a few words.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—We will be very glad.

President.—Because, you see, the President speaking from his Presidential Chair is not considered very proper. I have understood from a Member who has got long experience in these matters, that the proper course for the President, especially in controversial matters, is to leave his Chair and take his place among the Members of the party on whose side he wants to speak, and then speak. That is why I say there is some awkwardness in my speaking from the Chair.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The only point I want to bring to your notice is that we would like to hear the opinion of some other impartial person regarding our fitness and other things, about which reference was made in the Secretary's speech.

President.—Before that, I think, the Council Secretary will have to say something.

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—Sir, I have to say only a few words. I hope the Members on the other side will kindly give me a patient hearing and not dislike the Legislative Council as some disliked Dr. Fell. The lines, Sir, will, perhaps, be familiar to the Council:

I do not like thee, Dr. Fell,
The reason why I cannot tell,
But this I know, I know full well,
I do not like thee, Dr. Fell.

The Council should not be disliked in that way. (*Laughter.*)

Now, I shall just place before you a few facts from which you will see that neither is our Legislative Council such a bad affair as you take it to be, nor the interpretation put on certain Rules and Standing Orders by the President so restricted as you seem to think.

If you will kindly read the Council Rules and Regulations of the sister States of Mysore and Travancore, and also see those of the Provincial Councils in British India, you will find that ours have got a family resemblance with them; the Rules and Regulations of Travancore are practically the same as ours.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

So that, we cannot say that we are in a worse position than the sister States and the Provinces of British India.

Then, there is another point which we should take note of, and it is this. In Mysore, they had to go through the Dasra Assembly before they were gifted with the Legislative Council and in Travancore they had to go through the Sri Mulam Popular Assembly. Here, we had not to pass through the period of pupilage, but were given by our Gracious Ruler all the privileges of manhood all at once; we were given a Legislative Council, in every way similar to the Councils of the sister States and the Provincial Councils. (*Hear, hear.*)

Then, let us examine the functions of these bodies. First let us take legislation. In a Legislative Council, the art of law-making is an important work. Have the Government, at any time, restricted or cast any impediment in the way of the non-officials with regard to this matter? Certainly not, so far as we are concerned. We have passed about 9 official Bills, and 5 non-official Bills, and these have received the assent of His Gracious Highness the Maharaja. With reference to the non-official Bills, the attitude taken by the Government have always been to accept everything that is just and equitable, and is in consonance with the dictates of good conscience. There has been absolutely no restriction placed on the path of any Member by the Government in this work of legislation, which is one of the most important functions of the Legislative Council. There you have been doing good work, for which the Government are certainly grateful to you.

Next, please consider the discussion of the budget. Let us not slight that work simply because we have not got the power of the purse. Have you not got the power to vote for a large amount for Government expenditure? Is not your voice respected in those matters? Only the other day you carried by a majority cut motions of Rs. 55,000 and Rs. 20,000, and I think the Government are likely to accept them. Why should you think or say your opinion is flouted, when that is not really so done? We respect it in all possible ways.

Dr A. G. Menon.—Is it the Government's view or the Secretary's view that these cuts will be accepted?

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—I said it is *likely* to be accepted. I was very careful in the words I used. I realise that I am somewhat in the anomalous position of the bat, when the beasts and birds went to war. (*Laughter.*) I am particularly careful; I said *likely*. (*Hear, hear.*)

A word about resolutions. There were 26 resolutions discussed in this Council, of which 12 were passed by it, 6 were withdrawn by the movers, 5 lost and 3 accepted by the Govern-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

ment even before they were put to the vote of the House. And the only point you raise about them is that all the resolutions passed by you have not been acted upon as expeditiously as you want them to be.

For irrigation, about the resolution on which the Member for Jews spoke so much, the Government have in this budget made a provision of Rs. 16,000. Is it for nothing? (*Cries of "No" "no"*). Before making a large expenditure on irrigation, are we not to investigate the practical nature of the several projects? Before I leave this, I must candidly say that you cannot expect your recommendations to be considered as mandates; your recommendations will have, no doubt, great weight with the Government.

Then, with regard to questions, we have answered, I think, about 1,356 questions and, in my humble opinion, that is a very creditable performance for a period of two and a half years.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Beautifully evasive answers we had.

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—Now, in the first place, there is the question of difference of opinion; and secondly, you must know that the crown of duty is not a crown of roses. If you happened to be here, and we there, then you will realise our difficulties.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Give us the chance. (*Loud and continued Laughter*).

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—If it is for getting such chances that the Legislative Council is to be used or to grind the communal axe, better we end it.

As to the interpretation of rules, let me say that, if you will kindly go through the proceedings of other Councils, I am sure you will find that the interpretation of this Council President has always been generous; and I hope it will not be a breach of confidence, if I tell you that, so far as interpretation is concerned, wherever I have placed before him strict interpretation of the rules, he has always said, "No, no, let us be generous," (*Hear, hear.*)

President.—Yes, we have often been giving the benefit of the doubt to you.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Oh! we had always a creeping feeling that it is the Secretary's interpretation, and he is standing in the way.

Mr. T. K. KrishnaMenon.—I know there are some members who think that I am the imp behind the President, (*Laughter*) but it is neither he nor I that stands in the way. There are the rules. Out of respect to the dignity of the Council, we should

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

follow them to the very letter. For these reasons, I appeal to you, is it necessary that we should scratch the Council in the same way that we want to do away with the Tramway? If this question of abolition is a plank in the platform of your next election compaign, I do not think your constituents will support it.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—How do you know that?

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—I know that, because, for the purpose of this Council, a few of us, as the members of the Mahajana Sabha, had to go through every district, and we know that the people will not stand for the abolition of the Legislative Council If your powers are restricted here, that is the greater reason why you should work to get them in an ampler measure. Let our beloved Highness know that we are conducting ourselves satisfactorily and, sure enough, you will get greater instalments of reform and of power. We have worked only two and a half years, and what are two and a half years in the life-time of a Council? We have no reason to brood in disdain over a dark lot. Please do not say that the struggle not availeth, and things reamin where they were.

For while the tired waves vainly breaking,
Seem here no painful inch to gain,
Far back, thro' creeks and inlet making,
Come silent, flooding in, the main.

The present is yours; if you improve it, His Highness is sure to be pleased to make us partners in an increasing measure. A noble people, it is truly said, cannot have an ignoble Council. And if you always think that we are working for a great destiny that is ours, we shall certainly realise that.

Mr. V. K. Kochunni Menon.—I beg to oppose the motion. It is not a matter to be discussed in this Council.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—But it has been allowed.

Mr. V. K. Kochunni Menon.—What is pointed out is that there are defects in the Council. The provisions in the Regulation are not sufficient to give the Council the status of a self-governing institution. By the Regulation it is not intended to give us such a power. It is only an advisory body. Rule 34 (1) strictly prohibits a discussion in a matter like this; also Section 11 of the Council Regulations.

President.—This discussion is against provisions and Rules of the Regulation. Here they want more powers. It may be taken as discussion. If it is a Resolution, I would not have allowed.

Mr. V. K. Kochunni Menon.—That is what I exactly mean the powers are not sufficient.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Nobody tells that. Let the Hon'ble Member read the motion.

Mr. O. R. Chummar.—Sir, I oppose the motion. If I have understood correctly the issue, I think they have raised a question regarding the change in the form of the Government.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Certainly not

Mr. O. R. Chummar.—The discussion has been about progressive realisation of responsible Government. On that point it is that I intend to oppose the motion. As regards the treatment, I have not much to say.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—I move that the question be put and passed.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—I second it.

President.—Before I put the motion under discussion to the vote of the House, I would like to offer a few remarks by way of explanation as to the way in which the present administration is conducted, and I would therefore crave your indulgence for a short time in presenting my view of the matter. (*Hear, hear.*) You will know that I had not the opportunity to make any comment on the many and varied points raised in the general discussion of the budget; nor had I the opportunity to speak in regard to the merits of the cut motions pressed to a division in connection with the working of the various departments. Now that we are on the consideration of the cut motions on the general administration, I would like to avail myself of this last opportunity to travel the whole ground in a general way.

I regret very much that the leader of the Progressive Party who led the general discussion, had to be suddenly stopped on account of my ruling on the subject. The circumstances under which the ruling came to be passed are well-known to you and I do not want to refer to them here. I entirely differ from his view as well as that of the other Members who share his views that the Cochin Legislative Council, in the way in which it is now functioning, serves no useful public purpose. (*Hear, hear.*) I see immense advantage flowing from the working of this institution and, were I on the non-official side, I would fight every inch for its gradual development on sound and progressive lines. (*Hear, hear.*) The fact that you have not been given full powers all on a sudden need not discourage you. We have to render ourselves fit for the discharge of more responsible functions, and His Highness the Maharaja will only be too glad to give you those powers if His Highness were convinced that those powers would be exercised to the advantage of the people. (*Hear, hear.*)

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

So far, as regards the speech of the leader of the Progressive Party.

The next speech I would like to refer to is that of the Member for Chalakkudi, and the Government came in for a lot of criticisms at his hands. I was really pained to hear him remark that the demand 'General Administration' was given a very subordinate place and it was purposely shunted to almost the last day. If there is any insinuation in it, I take it to be that the Government wanted to burke discussion on the short-comings of the General Administration and would like to avoid, as far as possible, all the unpleasant things that the Members would be exposing. (*Certainly not.*) Well, I say this is an unwarranted insinuation. Having regard to my experience for the last two years and the two budget sessions, I found that the time allotted for discussing the more important spending departments was very limited and that we were spending more time over minor departments. Representations were also made to me in regard to this matter. I considered the matter carefully and came to a conclusion as to how the discussion should be pursued. Had I the slightest hint that objection would be taken that the general administration was not given a prominent place, I would certainly have put it in the forefront, and even today we have given it the first place. A full day was at your disposal and it was fully availed of.

I will refer only to one other matter in the speech of the Member for Chalakkudi and will not refer to any Member in particular for the remarks I am going to make. The Member has referred to the question of the Kokkalai rice mill manifestly for the purpose of questioning the action of the Government in that matter. I really fail to understand what relevancy that small matter of Kokkalai rice mill has to do with the general discussion. After all, it is one of the numerous administrative acts of a routine nature which the Diwan has to do, and I wonder why this personal matter should be brought to the notice of the House for consideration. We would not have known anything about this Kokkalai rice mill if Mr. Ayyappan or Mrs. Velayudha Menon were the owner of the Ratna Vilas. The newspapers took up the question for consideration and all sorts of things were said about the Government's decision in the matter. I went carefully into the matter and disposed of the question in a lengthy order, which I have no objection whatever to make public and in which all the facts and circumstances of the case have been fully set out and the reasons for my decision clearly explained. Those who do not take a dispassionate view of the question that arose for decision will not be convinced,

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

however sound the reasons may be. But I am prepared to face an impartial tribunal and submit the case to the judgment of that tribunal.

Another point to which I would like to make reference—excuse me if I dwell upon some important aspects brought forward in the general discussion—is the remark about hoarding up surpluses and presenting balanced budgets. It was also stated that the State ought not to be administered in the same way as business concerns. Without, in any way supporting the position that the administration of State stands on the same footing as the management of a business concern, I feel bound to point out that the financial side of the administration of a State has always to be carefully borne in mind and that there must be a serious and earnest attempt to tap all reasonable sources of revenue for the purpose of utilising the same to meet the evergrowing demands of the State and, in doing so, it is necessary that the expenditure is not allowed to outgrow the income. The Diwan is represented to constitute the brain of the administrative army and, if that is true, as I think it is, it is his bounden duty to see that he has enough powder and that it is always kept dry. It is true that the one aim of the Government should not be to show savings by means fair or foul. As regards the large surpluses, occasion may, all on a sudden, arise for their use. (*Hear, hear.*) I know that in Baroda one year's income is considered to be the surplus that is necessary for carrying on the affairs of the State on proper lines. We have not yet come to such a stage. I do not know how long our surplus will remain with us, for the days are not far distant when we will be called upon to make contributions out of it in a large measure to so many demands.

Another charge that has been raised against the present administration is that there is want of imagination, and there is no broad out-look necessary to carry on the administration on sound lines. I do not really know what this imagination is. I can go on imagining and imagining and build castles in the air; but what is the use? Here we have a small State with a limited population having our rupees, annas and pies and we have to meet the demand in rupees, annas and pies. We have not got what is called the paper currency. We cannot afford to go in for large debts and it is my considered opinion that the State should not embark upon raising loans when it is not absolutely necessary. There may be differences of opinion in regard to this matter, but my considered view is what I have stated above.

It has been stated that the Government machinery is moving very slowly, that there is a general feeling that things are

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

not getting on as they ought to be and that the administration is weak and inefficient. While I undertake the responsibility for all the actions of the Government during the period I have been in charge of the administration, I want to make it plain to the Members of the House that charges of a general and vague nature do not carry conviction, however eloquent and forcible the language of the speaker to support the charge might be. What will carry conviction is facts and figures to show that the administration has gone wrong in this particular and that particular. I do not mean to contend before you that the actions of the Government will, if subjected to close scrutiny, be above criticism. As I have often told you in this House, no man is infallible and I know my shortcomings more than any one of you. What I want to maintain is that facts have to be carefully collected, sifted and considered before any conclusion is drawn. Inferences are easily made on unfounded reports and hearsay information and are presented in fiery language with considerable feeling put into it. There is a great deal of truth in the utterance made by the Hon'ble Member for Irinjalakkuda that irresponsible opposition produces no useful criticism. I perfectly agree with that. (*Hear, hear.*) I will not go the length of saying that the Members of the House are an irresponsible body. I know that it is not your fault because in the manner in which we carry on the administration here, you are always on the side of opposition, that is to say, the party in opposition, so called, remains in opposition for ever. All that I am particular about is that whatever is spoken on the floor of this House must be spoken under a sense of responsibility and such a responsibility can ordinarily arise only when you, who are on the opposition side, have to bear the burden of administration. (*Hear, hear.*) Such a state of things is possible only where party Government prevails. In such a system of Government, both parties have at one time or another an opportunity to be in power. The practical difficulties of administration will thus be fully known to both parties and whatever criticisms are offered against Government measures would be only on a careful review of all the facts and circumstances of the case. In the way in which matters are now constituted, criticisms proceeding from the non-official Members are bound to be defective. Let it not be understood that I do not attach due importance to the criticisms of the non-official Members. By all means criticise the actions and measures of the Government. You are not here to applaud the actions of the Government and you will not be doing your duty to the constituency which has placed trust in you to come here and

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

sing the praises of the Government. What I want is criticism based upon facts. (*Hear, hear.*) I wish to point out that I have the highest authority for saying that the administration of Indian States is in many respects more difficult than that of British Provinces. (*Hear, hear.*) Paradoxical as it may appear, the smaller the State, the more difficult its administration is. This is the considered opinion of one of the distinguished administrators for whom one and all of us have the highest respect, one who has the ripe experience and knowledge of practical administration in British India and who has weilded the destiny of two of the important Native States with universal distinction.

Occupying as I do the position as the executive head of the administration, I am always before the public and the public has a right to judge my actions. They are entitled to say whether I have discharged my duty in promoting the welfare of the people properly. I have attempted to do my best in this direction. As for appreciation, I am by no means a proper judge; but I have come to realise the truth that the Diwan does not command the same kind of appreciation during the whole period of his Diwanship. For the first year a new Diwan receives universal praise. (*Hear, hear.*) Later on, the voice of criticism springs up, and towards the close of the Diwan's term of office, he gets very little beyond abuse. How true these expressions, given expression to by one of the noblest sons of earth who was himself a Diwan in more than one State, have become! I have been asked to bear this truism in mind and this was conveyed to me as a warning in the very first year of my Diwanship and, in conveying the said warning, it was pointed out that it was probably not quite necessary in my case. I am not affected either by praise or censure. We have always to reckon with the fickleness of the multitude and, as a well-known poet has expressed, "Success and defeat chase our course through life's uncertain race".

I will not further tax your patience. There is only ten minutes more. But, before I close, I cannot help making a loyal and humble reference to His Highness the Maharaja—our gracious and beloved Maharaja. In the present Ruler of the State the people of Cochin have an ideal Sovereign (*Hear, hear*) with a constitutional mentality and, take it from me, that there was hardly any instance in the course of the administration of the State during my executive headship in which my recommendations were vetoed by His Highness and I was asked to carry out a measure opposed to my conscience. On all occasions in which I had to take the commands of His Highness in regard to any administrative measure or action His Highness has always been pleased to say that His Highness would accept the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Diwan's advice. If there is anything amiss in the present administration, if there is any slackening in the machinery, if it is weak or inefficient, I take upon myself the entire responsibility. As a distinguished countryman of ours has recently said "Young men always resent the idea of being instructed by older men. The general feeling in the minds of young men of all countries is that if only the older men would clear out they will be able to govern their country better". Well, that distinguished gentleman himself entertained this opinion when he was young, but he had to change it. I don't know, I have not enquired about it, what opinion I held while I was young. Now I find that, unless you have practical experience to back you, you are more often liable to commit error. (*Hear, hear.*)

A great deal has been said about long deliberation and no decision. I am a man who takes time in deliberating and I am sorry that none of you can change it. It is a thing that has been growing with me for years and, at this time of my age, you cannot teach me new tricks. But I have found deliberation to be a very essential virtue and I have known from my long experience as a humble servant of His Highness the Maharaja that decisions passed in a hasty way are more often erroneous than right. My function as a Judge was one of the easiest for me. The vakils are there to represent both sides and I have only to pass a decision in the light of what I considered to be right. Now a petitioner comes before me and lays his grievances and would like to have immediate orders passed one way or the other. Do you think I will be right in either granting or refusing his request on the spur of the moment? Have not references to be made to the heads of the particular departments as to whether there is any ground for the allegations made and what recommendation they have to make? Sometimes I may not agree with the recommendations, but at the same, I will have to see that I don't belittle them. I have also to see that the result of my orders does not affect the public in a prejudicial way. In some cases, it will be more a case of expediency than of passing the right order.

The Diwan and the Heads of Departments loyally and zealously co-operating with him are participating in the deliberations of this Council for the purpose of contributing their mite to the promotion of public welfare and not for the purpose of being subjected to unfounded criticisms, not for the purpose of their motives underlying their several official acts being enquired into and unjust imputations made. I am particularly zealous in guarding the high moral tone of the council and it gives me no small pain when I find that, instead of concentrating our attention on the main and serious issues, we are distracted by side and petty issues and personal reflections. The feelings of every one

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

of us require to be respected, and the consideration of all questions must be dispassionate and impersonal. We must follow the salutary rule that criticisms should be not of men but of measures. (*Hear, hear.*) Let us, as a united body, be the staunchest of champions for the public cause, the fairest of fighters in the Council and the best of friends outside. (*Hear, hear.*) Now that I have reached the end of what I have to say, I will put the token motion to the vote of the House. I may assure you that I shall not in the least be affected either by victory or defeat and we part as members of a general brotherhood. I will now put the motion to the vote.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—In the light of the explanation offered by the President and the united opinion of the party, I beg leave of this House to withdraw this motion. (*Hear, hear.*) In doing so, if I don't go out of my way, I would like to say only one word. Well, I entirely endorse many of the views expressed here, I may say that, so far as I am concerned, many of the questions that I have raised I have taken pains to study. Another point I want to make clear is that one of the best gentlemen sitting on that side of the House said this morning that he cannot control his own temper. I mean the learned Advocate. If it is so, I expect that the large-heartedness of the official block will find a corner for even those whose temper could not be controlled on this side. No-body is more particular in keeping friendly relations between the officials and the non-officials than myself. I shall do my duty and you should consider what your duties are.

The question of withdrawing the motion for reducing the allotment of Rs. 15,815 for the Legislative Council by one rupee was put to the vote and was carried.

President.—We have reached the time limit, and I shall put the entire demand to the vote of the House.

The question of granting the allotment of Rs. 60,317 under "General Admininistration" was put to the vote and was carried.

The maximum time allotted for the discussion of the Demand for "General Administration" having expired, the following motions were considered to have lapsed.

General Administration—Total.

Mr. George Chakyamuri.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,10,800 under "Demand No. XIII" by one rupee.*

Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,10,800 under "Demand No. XIII" by one rupee.*

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,10,800, under "Demand No. XIII" by one rupee.*

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. K. S. Rama Ayyar.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,10,800 under "Demand No. XIII" by Rs. 55,400.*

Mr. M. K. Raman.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 60,378 under "Demand No. XIII" by one rupee.*

Mr. K. Sankaran Nambudiri.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1,10,800 under "Demand No. XIII" by Rs. 5.*

The House then rose, it being 5. p. m.

T. K. KRISHNA MENON,
Secretary to the Council.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly